

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA

March 16, 2023 at 6:30 P.M.

AMEDEE O. "DICK" RICHARDS, JR. COUNCIL CHAMBERS
1424 MISSION STREET

ROLL CALL

The meeting convened at: 6:30 pm

Commissioners Present: Mark Gallatin (Chair), William Cross, Kristin Morrish and Jeremy Ding

Commissioners Absent: Conrado Lopez (Vice-Chair)

Council Liaison: Evelyn G. Zneimer, Mayor Pro Tem

Staff Present: Matt Chang (Planning Manager), Braulio Madrid (Associate Planner), Sandra Robles (Associate Planner), Mackenzie Goldberg (Assistant Planner)

Please Note: These Minutes are a summary of the meetings and are not a fully transcribed record.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

The Commissioners voted by voice vote.

Approved, 4-0.

DISCLOSURE OF SITE VISITS AND EX-PARTE CONTACTS

Commissioner Cross drove by and took photographs of each property listed on the agenda. Chair Gallatin had two (2) meetings as part of the Subcommittee for the project at 504 El Centro Street – a virtual meeting and an in-person meeting conducted at City Hall. In addition, Chair Gallatin drove by the El Centro site and the property at 1716 Wayne Avenue.

PUBLIC COMMENT

1. **Public Comments – General (Non-Agenda Items)**
None.

CONSENT CALENDAR ITEMS

2. **Minutes from the Regular Meeting of May 19, 2022**
3. **Minutes from the Regular Meeting of June 16, 2022**

Commissioner Cross moved, seconded by Commissioner Morrish, to approve both sets of minutes.

The Commissioners voted by voice vote.

Approved, 4-0.

BUSINESS ITEM

4. Cultural Heritage Commission Reorganization

Recommendation:

Select a Chair and Vice-Chair.

Presentation:

Planning Manager Chang explained that it was time to select a new Chair and Vice-Chair of the Commission. He explained the process and the term.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners agreed that current Chair Gallatin and Vice-Chair Lopez have served admirably in their present positions over the last year and enthusiastically supported having them continue in their respective positions for another term.

Decision:

Commissioner Morrish moved, seconded by Commissioner Cross, to nominate Chair Gallatin to continue to serve as Chair of the Commission for the 2023 year.

Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Commissioner Ding	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

Motion carried, 4-0.

Commissioner Morrish moved, seconded by Commissioner Cross, to nominate Vice-Chair Lopez to continue to serve as Vice-Chair of the Commission for the 2023 year.

Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Commissioner Ding	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

Motion carried, 4-0.

PUBLIC HEARING

- 5. **504 El Centro Street, Project No. 2443-COA/AUP** – A Certificate of Appropriateness to add a 732 square-foot first-story addition, a 379-square foot second-story addition with a 144-square-foot balcony, to demolish a 216 square-foot one-car garage, to construct a new 406 square-foot two-car garage and an Administrative Use Permit for a side and rear yard setback reduction at 504 El Centro Street (APN: 5313-

008-003). In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) the project qualifies for a Categorical Exemption under Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation).

Recommendation:

Find the project exempt from CEQA pursuant to Sections 15301 and 15331. Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness and Administrative Use Permit, subject to the Conditions of Approval.

Presentation:

Associate Planner Robles presented a PowerPoint presentation.

Questions for Staff:

None.

Applicant Presentation:

None.

Questions for Applicant:

Chair Gallatin inquired about the possible reuse of the windows to be removed from the rear of the house due to the addition, and reuse of the garage door. The project designer explained there was severe water damage to the windows that made them impossible to reuse and that the garage door was too deteriorated to be reused. Chair Gallatin and the Applicant discussed the selection, reuse and installation of the windows.

Public Comments:

None.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners complimented the new proposed design. Commissioner Morrish appreciated all the work and effort on the project.

Commissioner Cross thanked homeowners Mr. and Mrs. Felix for their patience in working through this process and for their willingness to consider some of the suggested changes of the Subcommittee. In addition, he thanked the designer for executing the changes on the plans. The concerns expressed back in January were all addressed.

Decision:

Commissioner Cross moved, seconded by Commissioner Ding, to approve this project, per the Findings in the Staff Report. In addition, the following will be included as Conditions of Approval: to remove the glass blocks at the East elevation; continue to find solutions to fill the void space by possibly redistributing the stair landing square footage; to fix Note 25, which identified lighting on the proposed North elevation; and to recess the windows to match the existing windows.

Chair Gallatin asked Staff for a roll call vote:

Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes

Commissioner Ding Yes
Chair Gallatin Yes

Motion carried, 4-0.

6. **1716 Wayne Avenue, Project No. 2481-COA** – A Certificate of Appropriateness to add a 702.5 square-foot, two-story addition to an existing 1,902 square-foot two-story single-family residence located at 1716 Wayne Avenue (APN: 5321-010-003). In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the project qualifies for a Categorical Exemption under Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation).

Recommendation:

Find the project exempt from CEQA pursuant to Sections 15301 and 15331. Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the Conditions of Approval.

Presentation:

Associate Planner Madrid presented a PowerPoint presentation.

Questions for Staff:

Commissioner Morrish asked when the project was submitted. Associate Planner Madrid noted that the initial submittal was last year. The project was recently scheduled for the January 2023 Public Hearing, but at the request of the Applicant, the project was continued to make modifications.

Chair Gallatin asked for a clarification of the note on the plans regarding the composition of the windows and the reference to PVC. Associate Planner Madrid confirmed that the material proposed is vinyl.

Applicant Presentation:

None.

Questions for Applicant:

Commissioner Morrish inquired about the roof and the existing windows on the East elevation on the second floor. The Applicant clarified that the windows would remain untouched and discussed the roofing issues. She also asked about differentiation between the existing and the new addition and recommended the City's *Residential Design Guidelines* as a good reference.

Chair Gallatin remarked that there were many inconsistencies and incorrect information in the plans that made it difficult to understand the intent. He gave several examples. The Applicant responded that the drafting errors in the drawings would be updated, but the intention was to match whatever is existing. In addition, they also submitted window specifications.

Chair Gallatin encouraged the Applicant to review the Secretary of Interior's Standards for *Rehabilitation of Historic Buildings* and noted that those are the standards that the Commission uses to evaluate these projects. The *Standards* includes an explanation about differentiation. He also encouraged the Applicant to review the City's *Residential Design Guidelines*, specifically pages 36-39.

Public Comments:

None.

Applicant’s Rebuttal:

None.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners agreed that it might be good for the Applicant to revise and clarify the plans and resubmit them for the next scheduled meeting.

Commissioner Ding added (confirmed by Planning Manager Chang) that the video of tonight’s meeting with all of the Commissioners’ comments should be available as early as next week for reference.

Chair Gallatin encouraged the Applicant to work closely with Staff. He also offered his own services. Planning Manager Chang explained several options for the Applicant in addition to having the Chair work with the Applicant, including but not limited to, formation of a subcommittee and working with Staff.

Commissioner Morrish encouraged the Applicant to look at the City’s Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards and all of the written materials that Staff has about historic resources and historic homes in South Pasadena.

Decision:

Commissioner Ding moved, seconded by Chair Gallatin, to continue this project to the next scheduled meeting on April 20, 2023.

Chair Gallatin asked Staff for a roll call vote:

Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Commissioner Ding	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

Motion passed, 4-0.

- 7. **1936 Fletcher Avenue, Project No. 2545-COA** – A Certificate of Appropriateness to add a 589 square-foot addition and 290 square-foot patio to the rear of an existing 1,704 square-foot single-family residence at 1936 Fletcher Avenue (APN: 5321-038-010). In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the project qualifies for a Categorical Exemption under Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation).

Recommendation:

Find the project exempt from CEQA pursuant to Sections 15301 and 15331. Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the Conditions of Approval.

Staff Presentation:

Assistant Planner Goldberg presented a PowerPoint presentation.

Questions for Staff:

None.

Applicant Presentation:

None.

Questions for Applicant:

Chair Gallatin and the Applicant reviewed the drawings and addressed several discrepancies in the submittal.

Applicant’s Rebuttal:

None.

Public Comments:

None.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners expressed approval of the plans as presented and agreed the project was well designed. They praised the architect and the Applicant for checking all the boxes and working closely with the Design Guidelines and the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards.

Decision:

Commissioner Morrish moved, seconded by Commissioner Ding, to approve the project as presented. The Mandatory Findings and Project Specific Findings 2, 3 and 5 can be made. The project is exempt from CEQA Sections 15301, Class 1 and 15331, Class 31.

Chair Gallatin asked Staff for a roll call vote:

Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Ding	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

Motion carried, 4-0.

ADMINISTRATION

8. Comments from Council Liaison:

None.

9. Comments from Commissioners:

None.

10. Comments from Subcommittees:

None.

11. Comments from South Pasadena Preservation Foundation (SPPF) Liaison:

Chair Gallatin announced that the SPPF’s Annual Meeting will occur the weekend of June 24th or 25th. There will be a special program honoring Adobe Flores, the oldest building in South Pasadena, dating from the 1840s. He provided a brief background and the historical importance of Adobe Flores during the Mexican-American War and its connection to the Treaty of Cahuenga. He remarked that although it is a City Landmark and on the National Register, it does not have a State Landmark designation. He noted the efforts to possibly pursue a State Landmark designation.

12. Comments from Staff:

Planning Manager Chang reported that Landmark Number 59 for the Cox House at 534 Arroyo Drive was approved by City Council last night. It was brought before the Commission earlier this year. He thanked Subcommittee members Vice-Chair Lopez and Commissioner Cross for their efforts on the project.

Staff submitted the fifth draft of the Housing Element to the HCD this past Monday. HCD has 45 days to review it and respond, which should be around April 27th. Per the Settlement Court Order, the City has to adopt Housing Element by May 31st.

Planning Manager Chang reported on the Oaklawn Bridge, the bridge giving access between Fair Oaks Avenue and Oaklawn Avenue, which has been temporarily closed for safety concerns. Public Works staff reported that a consultant will inspect the bridge to assess the structural integrity, any cracking and the Waiting Station for roof damage and determine the costs to repair the damage. Commissioner Cross reminded the Commission that the Tournament of Roses builds a float underneath the bridge and the rehab of the bridge should consider that so that it does not conflict. Chair Gallatin added that because it is a historic bridge and a historic waiting station, it would need to be restored and repaired to the Secretary of the Interior’s Standards. He encouraged the City to use structural engineers who specialize in historic structures and buildings and mentioned that he provided Public Works Director Ted Gerber names of engineers he has worked with in the past that specialize in historic buildings.

Lastly, there will be a Commissioner Congress on June 28th, 6:00 – 8:00 pm. Staff will provide a work plan that will include accomplishments of last year.

Chair Gallatin inquired about the Certified Local Government (CLG) Report due by the end of the month. Planning Manager Chang remarked that Staff had received several Commissioners’ responses and they are on target to submit the CLG Annual Report by March 31st.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:09 pm to the next regular meeting of the Cultural Heritage Commission on April 20, 2023 at 6:30 pm.

APPROVED,



Mark Gallatin
Chair, Cultural Heritage Commission



Date