

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA

May 18, 2023 at 6:30 P.M.

CITY MANAGER'S CONFERENCE ROOM
1414 MISSION STREET, SOUTH PASADENA, CA 91030

ROLL CALL

The meeting convened at: 6:30 pm
Commissioners Present: Mark Gallatin (Chair), William Cross, Kristin Morrish and Jeremy Ding
Commissioners Absent: Conrado Lopez (Vice-Chair)
Staff Present: Matt Chang (Planning Manager), Braulio Madrid (Associate Planner), Sandra Robles (Associate Planner) and Mackenzie Goldberg (Assistant Planner)

Please Note: These Minutes are a summary of the meetings and are not a fully transcribed record.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA

Approved, 4-0.

DISCLOSURE OF SITE VISITS AND EX-PARTE CONTACTS

Commissioner Cross drove by each property listed on the agenda.
Chair Gallatin drove by 1400 Mission Street (Item 4) and 1130 Meridian Avenue (Item 5).

PUBLIC COMMENT

1. Public Comments – General (Non-Agenda Items)

None.

CONSENT CALENDAR ITEM

2. Minutes from the Special Meeting of October 26, 2022

Chair Gallatin proposed a correction to the minutes under Item 7 under Applicant Presentation. Commissioner Morrish moved, seconded by Commissioner Cross, to approve the minutes with the correction.

Approved, 4-0.

CONTINUED ITEM

- 3. 1716 Wayne Avenue, Project No. 2481-COA** – A Certificate of Appropriateness to add a 702.5 square-foot, two-story addition to an existing 1,902 square-foot two-story single-family residence located at 1716 Wayne Avenue (APN: 5321-010-003). In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the project qualifies for a Categorical Exemption under Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation).

This item was continued from the regularly scheduled April 20, 2023 Cultural Heritage Commission meeting.

Recommendation:

Continue this item to the June 15, 2023 Cultural Heritage Commission meeting.

Presentation:

None. Commissioner Ding remarked that the Subcommittee (comprised of Vice-Chair Lopez and himself) had been available; however, per Staff, the Applicant was not quite ready yet.

Decision:

Commissioner Ding moved, seconded by Commissioner Morrish, to continue this item to the June 15, 2023 Cultural Heritage Commission meeting.

Motion carried, 4-0.

PUBLIC HEARING

- 4. 1400 Mission Street, Project No. 2495-NID/CUP/DRX** – A request for a Notice of Intent to Demolish a 643 square-foot convenience store and a 1,221 square-foot repair garage at the Chevron gas station located at 1400 Mission Street (APN: 5315-002-030). A project that includes the demolition of buildings constructed at least 45 years prior to date of the application are required to be evaluated by the Cultural Heritage Commission to determine if the property could potentially meet national, state, or local criteria for historic designation. In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the project qualifies for the Categorical Exemption under Section 15061(b)(3) - Common Sense Exemption; Class 2, Section 15302 (Replacement or Reconstruction); and Class 3, Section 15303 (New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures).

Recommendation:

Find the project exempt from CEQA pursuant to Sections 15061(b)(3) and 15302, and 15303. Determine that the two structures located at 1400 Mission Street do not meet the nation, state or local criteria for historic designation and the project may proceed through the City's development application process.

Presentation:

Associate Planner Robles presented a PowerPoint presentation. City Consultant Michelle Anderson (via Zoom) and the Applicant's representative (in Chambers), were available to answer questions.

Questions for Staff:

Chair Gallatin noted a correction in the staff report and pointed out that the qualifying criteria for the National Register are the significance and integrity of the historic resource and have nothing to do with Federal licensing permitting funding.

Applicant Presentation:

None. However, the Applicant’s representative was present and thanked the Commission for its consideration of the project.

Questions for Applicant:

None.

Public Comment:

None.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners commended the project and thought it well done.

Decision:

Commissioner Morrish moved, seconded by Commissioner Ding, to find the project exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15061(b)(3), 15302 and 15303, and that it does not meet the national, state or local criteria for historic designation.

Chair Gallatin asked Staff for a Roll Call vote:

Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Ding	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

Motion carried, 4-0.

- 5. **1130 Meridian Avenue, Project No. 2514-COA/TRP** – A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 246 square-foot first floor addition and a new 577 square-foot second floor addition to an existing one-story, 945 square-foot single-family residence, and a Tree Removal Permit for the removal of two (2) non-native trees for a property located at 1130 Meridian Avenue (APN: 5315-006-044). In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the project qualifies for a Categorical Exemption under Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration/ Rehabilitation).

Recommendation:

Find the project exempt from CEQA pursuant to Sections 15301 and 15331. Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness and Tree Removal Permit, subject to the Conditions of Approval.

Presentation:

Assistant Planner Goldberg presented a PowerPoint presentation.

Questions for Staff:

None.

Applicant Presentation:

The project architect presented a presentation.

Questions for Applicant:

Commissioner Morrish asked the project architect to expand about differentiation between the old and new, and whether the windows and door set for demolition were salvageable and reusable.

The project architect explained the differentiation and planned to re-use the windows if they are reusable.

Commissioner Cross asked if the color of the residence was changing. He enjoyed the color and hoped that the garden remained.

Chair Gallatin asked about the ceiling height of the addition and commented that the architect had done several things to mitigate the addition, including the articulation on the front and increasing the side yard setback on the North side. He also asked if the architect would be amenable to providing window detail to show how the windows would be recessed at the wall plane.

Public Comment:

None.

Applicant Rebuttal:

None.

Commission Discussion:

Commissioner Cross commented that he drives by the residence daily and has always enjoyed the color of the home, the architectural style and the garden.

Chair Gallatin thanked the project architect for the presentation because it showed how you can sensitively do a second-story addition on a one-story home and accommodate a growing family.

Decision:

Commissioner Morrish moved, seconded by Commissioner Ding, to find the project exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15301 and 15331 and to approve the Tree Removal Permit. The required Findings and Project Specific Findings 2, 3 and 5 can be made, with the added Condition of Approval that the project architect supply additional window details showing how they recess in the stucco.

Chair Gallatin asked Staff for a Roll Call vote:

Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Ding	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

Motion carried, 4-0.

6. **260 Hillside Road, Project No. 2543-COA** – A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a two-story, 2,668 square-foot rear addition with a balcony to an existing 5,281 square-foot single-family residence, for a property located at 260 Hillside Road (APN: 5317-039-011). In accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA), the project qualifies for a Categorical Exemption under Section 15301, Class 1 (Existing Facilities) and Section 15331, Class 31 (Historical Resource Restoration/Rehabilitation).

Recommendation:

Find the project exempt from CEQA pursuant to Sections 15301 and 15331. Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness, subject to the Conditions of Approval.

Presentation:

Associate Planner Madrid presented a PowerPoint presentation. The Applicant and homeowner were available for questions.

Questions for Staff:

Commissioner Morrish remarked about the importance of having a haul route for the proposed project.

The Commissioners and Associate Planner Madrid discussed the historic stone wall and expressed appreciation that no alterations were proposed to it. They also discussed the reference to Spanish Colonial Revival style and agreed the reference should be to Monterey Revival Style.

Applicant Presentation:

None.

Questions for Applicant:

Commissioner Morrish asked about the brick to be used on the addition.

Chair Gallatin had several questions, including regarding use of a licensed architect; use of a real brick veneer material and not an imitation product; existing windows and roof line, clarification of the doors and windows to be used; and the materials for the columns and rings on the balcony and balustrade.

Applicant Rebuttal:

None.

Commission Discussion:

The Commissioners had no major issues with the project and found it to be virtually not visible from the public right-of-way, blend in well with the existing architecture and take advantage of the topography of the site.

Decision:

Commissioner Morrish moved, seconded by Commissioner Ding, to approve this project as submitted. The mandatory Findings could be made. In addition, they can make Project Specific Finding 2 – it is appropriate to the size and effects of the neighborhood; Project Specific Finding 3 – it provides a clear distinction between the new addition and the existing; and Project Specific Finding 5 – it adds substantial new living space for the homeowner. Conditions of Approval will be added to include a Chair Review of the materials

to be used, including a review of the brick used, the wood windows to be used, and the materials used for the columns on the balcony.

Chair Gallatin asked Staff for a Roll Call vote:

Commissioner Cross	Yes
Commissioner Ding	Yes
Commissioner Morrish	Yes
Chair Gallatin	Yes

Motion carried, 4-0.

DISCUSSION ITEM

7. 2023 Annual Commission Report

Recommendation:

Discuss and approve the 2023 Annual Commission Report.

Staff Presentation:

Planning Manager Chang presented the draft report and thanked the Commissioners for their participation and feedback.

The Commissioners and staff discussed the content of the Annual Report and Work Plan.

Chair Gallatin suggested having a checklist of submittal requirements so that staff could hand it to applicants which would identify when an application is not complete.

Commissioner Morrish suggested including staff's efforts and progress addressing the backlog of minutes from two to three years ago as a Commission accomplishment.

Decision:

Chair Gallatin moved, seconded by Commissioner Morrish, to approve the Annual Report and the Work Plan for next year subject to the comments provided.

Approved, 4-0.

ADMINISTRATION

8. Comments from Council Liaison:

None.

9. Comments from Commissioners:

None.

10. Comments from Subcommittees:

None

11. Comments from Staff:

Planning Manager Chang reported on the status of the Draft Housing Element and the letter received from the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD).

Planning Manager Chang also reported that the Commissioners Congress will be held on June 28. He also reported that with regard to staffing, the department is in the process of recruiting a Senior Planner and a Planning Technician.

Chair Gallatin asked if the City does outreach to the local universities like USC, UCLA and Cal State Northridge that have planning programs and are graduating their classes about now.

Chair Gallatin inquired on the status of the improvements to the Rialto Theatre.

ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 8:03 pm to the next regular meeting of the Cultural Heritage Commission on June 15, 2023 at 6:30 pm.

APPROVED,



10-23-23

Mark Gallatin
Chair, Cultural Heritage Commission

Date