

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION
CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA, CALIFORNIA
CONVENED THIS 19TH DAY OF MARCH, 2015
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 1424 MISSION STREET**

ROLL CALL

The Meeting convened at: 6:45 PM

Commissioners Present: James McLane (Chair), Deborah Howell-Ardila (Vice-Chair), Robert Conte , West J. De Young, and Steven Treffers

Council Liaison Present: Richard D. Schneider M.D., Councilmember

Staff Liaison Present: John Mayer, Senior Planner

NON-AGENDA
PUBLIC COMMENT
PERIOD

1. Michael Culross raised concerns about a construction project at 820 Mission Street, which is behind his home at 815 Magnolia. He believes the height of the new structure will block the sunlight into his back yard.

Odom Stamps spoke about the South Pasadena Preservation Foundation's upcoming home tour.

PRESENTATION:

2. **815 Mission Street
Municipal Plunge Building**

Commissioner McLane introduced this item. He asked the Commission to review and provide edits to a draft memo he prepared for the City Council. The memo would contain the Commission's comments on a Community Activity Center at the Orange Grove Park. Comments in the memo are related to an option that would involve demolition of Landmark No. 45 (Municipal Plunge Building) located at 815 Mission Street.

Public Comment:

Odom Stamps said that hopes that the City will not demolish the Municipal Plunge Building and that the Commission recommends that the building and the pool be restored. Regarding the parking, Mr. Stamps believes that the parking structure could be constructed under the athletic fields.

Discussion:

Commissioner Howell-Ardila wants the memo to include information about how this demolition conflicts with the preservation ordinance and General Plan's Historic Preservation Element. She also wants the memo to clarify that the project would trigger an Environmental Impact Report because demolition would be a significant adverse impact to a historic resource.

Commissioner Treffers asked if the memo should include a recommendation about restoring the swimming pool that was once located behind the building. He also expressed concerns that the Municipal Plunge Building could fall into disrepair if it is vacated. It would be ideal to return it back to its original function as part of a restored swimming pool.

Commissioner Conte said that the memo should encourage the City Council to choose Option 2 because it is consistent with the City goals of being environmentally sensitive, and it would re-purpose an office building at the corner of El Centro Street and the Metro Gold Line right-of-way. That

would avoid the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) and parking issues.

Commissioner McLane said that the consultant who prepared the conceptual plans never dealt with historic buildings and treated the preservation issue superficially. He doesn't agree with the argument that the building is obsolete and unusable. It should be restored to its original function as part of a community center. Mr. McLane also noted that there was no information about why the parking lot entrance needed to be located at the Municipal Plunge building.

Commissioner De Young noted that based on the presentations, a majority of the users of the proposed facility would be senior citizens and teens. Commissioner De Young said that these groups might lower the demand for parking spaces and thus reduce the size of a parking structure. He also thinks that the community should be presented with the idea of restoring the swimming pool.

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (McLane/Howell-Ardila) to **APPROVE** the draft memo to City Council with the following amendments: 1) include the City's legal framework, goals, and policies about the City's obligation to protect its historic resources; 2) recommend that the City Council choose Option 2 (repurposing an office building on El Centro Street) and to consider restoring a swimming pool that was once located behind the Municipal Plunge Building; and 3) if the City Council chooses Orange Grove Park, that it considers locating the parking structure under the athletic fields.

The motion carried 5-0.

CONTINUED
APPLICATIONS

3. **1003 Monterey Road**
Applicant: Dr. Shahram Valiani
Project number: 1770-COA/DRX
Historic Status Code: 5S3

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the unpermitted replacement the existing wood windows of this historic house with vinyl windows.

Presentation:

Commissioner De Young reported on a subcommittee meeting he had with Commissioner Treffers and the applicant regarding the replacement of windows. Mr. De Young noted that there is not one original window in the house. He said that the subcommittee is recommending that the applicant keep the vinyl-framed windows on the side facing Meridian Avenue and to replace the vinyl-framed windows facing Monterey Road with wood-framed windows. Commissioner Treffers stated that he concurs with this compromise.

Dr. Shahram (applicant) stated that he is in agreement with this compromise.

Discussion:

Commissioners acknowledged that without information regarding the original windows, members of the Commission will need to provide some direction to the applicant. Commissioners debated about whether the new wood windows should have insulated glass.

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (Conte/De Young) to **APPROVE** the project with the **CONDITION** that: 1) the applicant agrees to the subcommittee's recommendation to keep the windows that were installed on the Meridian side of the house and replace the two unpermitted windows on the Monterey Road side with wood framed windows; and 2) that the windows be an appropriate design as determined by the subcommittee.

The motion carried 4-1, McLane opposed.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 1003 Monterey Road is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

4. 1305 Monterey Road

Applicant: Roger Bray, Architect

Project number: 1752-COA/DRX

Historic Status Code: 5S1

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of an existing 150 sq. ft. addition to the rear of the main structure and the removal of an unpermitted 216 sq. ft. attached structure to the main house. A proposal to build two, two story townhomes, 1,666 sq. ft. each in the rear of this property. The applicant is proposing to demolish the existing 528 sq. ft. detached two vehicle garage and replace it with a new 780 sq. ft. detached four vehicle carport. A new tandem 390 sq. ft. carport is proposed on the east side of the property. The exterior materials of the town house will be wood siding; double hung wood windows, and asphalt roof shingles. The exterior materials for the alterations to the main house will match the existing. The exterior materials for the new garage and carport will be similar to the existing main structure.

Presentation:

None

Public Comment:

None

Commission Decision:

The Commission **CONTINUED** this project to the April 16, 2015 meeting so that the applicant can address the Commission's concerns with the project.

5. 2043 Milan Avenue

Applicant: Virginia Paca, Architect

Project number: 1781-COA

Historic Status Code: 5D1

Project Description:

The proposed project would involve: 1) adding 2,685 square feet of new floor area to a Craftsman style house built in 1909; 2) the addition would raise the home's height and modifies the home's gabled roof line; 3) demolition of a detached two-car garage built in 1982; and 4) construction of a new three-car attached garage. The exterior walls of the addition would feature a 6" lap siding on the lower half, and wood shingles above it. All windows (except the original front windows) will be replaced with new custom dual-glazed wood-framed windows.

Presentation:

Virginia Paca (project architect) presented her project and spoke about revisions to her plans. She changed the roof line and pushed the second ridge back. Both sides of the addition were pulled in.

Public Comment:

None.

Discussion:

Commissioner McLane thanked the architect for addressing the Commission's concerns. Commissioners agreed that the revised project is a vast improvement to the original project presented last month.

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (McLane/De Young) to **APPROVE** the project as re-submitted. This motion was made on the finding that: the project is appropriate to the size, massing, and design context of the historic neighborhood, it provides a clear distinction between the new and historic elements, it adds substantial new living space without obliterating the home's original design, character, or heritage.

The motion carried 5-0.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the

property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 2043 Milan Avenue as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

6. **2017 Berkshire Avenue**
Applicant: Tom Nott, A.I.A.
Project number: 1786-COA
Historic Status Code: 5D1

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of an existing wood deck and a 202 square foot addition to a 1,285 square foot single story Prairie Influence style home. The addition would occur at the south side of the home and include a new 55.33 square foot brick porch and steps off the addition. The proposed wood window and stucco siding would match existing materials.

Presentation:

Tom Nott (project architect) said that he addressed the Commission's concerns by pushing the front wall back by 18 inches and added a porch with new landscaping.

Public Comment:

Glen Duncan (2031 Berkshire Avenue) spoke in opposition to the latest version of the project because the roof form changed. He said that it does not comply with the Design Guidelines in terms of roof forms.

Lucy Li (2017 Berkshire Avenue) said that her roof is not original and that her house was once part of the home next door. She also said that the left part of her house was added on. She responded to questions from the Commission regarding the proposed bedroom.

Discussion:

The Commission discussed the home's entrance, the length of the wall's recess, the roofline, the history of the house as a larger mansion, its historic significance, and views of the project from the street.

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (Conte/De Young) to **APPROVE** the project as resubmitted and with the following **CONDITION:** 1) The roofline shall be pulled back to reduce the project's visual impact as viewed from the street; and 2) and the walkway paving leading from the porch shall not lead to an entrance at Berkshire.

The motion carried 3-1-1, Howell-Ardila Opposed and De Young Abstained.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the

South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 2017 Berkshire Avenue as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

NEW ITEMS

7. **1030 Mission Street**
Applicant¹: Carol Meadows
Project number: 1801-COA
Historic Status Code: 1

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 6.75" x 115" awning sign onto a Vernacular commercial building. The proposed sign will read "TRINA TURK".

Presentation:

Carol Meadows (applicant) presented her project and spoke about improvements to the building.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (McLane/De Young) to **APPROVE** the project. This motion was made on the finding that the project is appropriate to the size and design context of the historic neighborhood.

The motion carried 5-0.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 1030 Mission Street as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

¹ Applicant name updated

8. 632 Milan Avenue
Applicant: Hao Hoang
Project number: 1792-COA
Historic Status Code: 5D1

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to modify a previously approved two-car detached garage and enlarge it to a 651 square foot three-car detached garage. The proposed addition would occur at the rear of a Craftsman style, single-family home. New wood clapboard siding, wood rafters, and asphalt roof materials will match existing home materials. Wood windows are from the front home back porch. Design is similar to the previously approved project.

Presentation:

Odom Stamps (representing owners) presented his project and spoke about the history of the house. Mr. Stamps responded to a question about a set back and an inquiry regarding a steel beam frame.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (Treffers/Howell-Ardila) to **APPROVE** the revised project as submitted.

The motion carried 5-0.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 632 Milan Avenue as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

9. **808 Adelaine Avenue**

Applicant: Abid Khan, Architect

Project number: 1797-COA

Historic Status Code: 5D1

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a 1,308 square foot addition to an existing 1,940 square foot Craftsman Bungalow style, single-family home. The proposed addition would occur at the rear of the home. Additionally, an illegally constructed study room at the west (front) elevation is proposed to be converted back into a full-length front porch. The existing 410 square foot garage would be relocated to the rear of the property. Materials will be changed to restore historical integrity to previously altered home and would include wood siding and asphalt shingle roof.

Presentation:

Steve Dahl and Abid Khan presented the project and responded to Commissioners' questions about windows, doors, and original features.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (McLane/De Young) to **APPROVE** the project as submitted. This motion was made on the finding that the project is appropriate to the size, massing, and design context of the historic neighborhood; it provides a clear distinction between the new and historic elements; and it nicely enhances the appearance of the residence without obliterating its original design, character, or heritage.

The motion carried 4-0, Howell-Ardila Absent.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 808 Adelaine as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

NEW BUSINESS

10. **Subcommittee for the San Pascual Stables**

The City Council is requesting a Cultural Heritage Commissioner to participate on a subcommittee that will identify the preferred use of the City-owned San Pascual stables property and “deal points” for the new operating lease to be subsequently negotiated.

Commissioner McLane spoke about a visit to the San Pascual Stables and how there’s opportunity to restore the barn and maintain an equestrian use.

Commissioner Howell-Ardila volunteered to be on the City Council’s subcommittee.

COMMUNICATIONS

11. **Comments from Council Liaison**

Commissioner McLane expressed his appreciation to Councilman Dr. Schneider for his attendance at tonight’s meeting.

Dr. Schneider said that he wants to see a Historic Structure Report for the Arroyo Golf Course restaurant. There are conceptual plans being prepared for a banquet room there. He also announced that he will request that the City fund a new historic resources survey for the current fiscal year. Dr. Schneider said that he would like to see properties within the State Route 710 Freeway study be evaluated first.

Dr. Schneider also spoke about the SR 710 Freeway Environmental Impact Report/Environmental Impact Statement.

12. **Comments from Commission**

Commissioner McLane commented on the City’s Strategic Planning Session.

Commissioner Howell-Ardila asked for the status of the Preservation Ordinance and noted that the Meridian Iron Works Museum needs to be painted.

Commissioner Conte said that the Commission should have a discussion item for a future meeting regarding Monterey Road improvements and how it would affect the South Pasadena’s small town feel.

13. **Comments from South Pasadena Preservation Foundation Liaison**

None.

14. **Comments from Staff**

None.

MINUTES

15. **Minutes of the meeting of January 15, 2015**

The Commission voted to **APPROVE** the minutes.

Minutes of the meeting of February 19, 2015

The Minutes were not available. The Commission continued this item to the next meeting.

ADJOURNMENT

16. **Meeting Adjourned at 9:58 p.m. to the regularly scheduled meeting of April 16, 2015.**

James McLane, Chair

Date

James McLane, Chair

Date

Apr 16, 2015