

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION
CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA, CALIFORNIA
CONVENED THIS 19TH DAY OF JANUARY, 2017
COUNCIL CHAMBERS, 1424 MISSION STREET**

ROLL CALL

The Meeting convened at: 6:50 PM

Commissioners Present: James McLane (Chair), West J. De Young,
Steven Friedman, and Mark Gallatin

Commissioners Absent: Deborah Howell-Ardila

Council Liaison Absent: Richard D. Schneider M.D., Councilmember

Staff Liaison Present: John Mayer, Senior Planner

**NON-AGENDA
PUBLIC COMMENT
PERIOD**

1. None

PRESENTATION

2. **Historic Resources Survey & Inventory of Addresses Survey Update**

Christine Lazaretto of Historic Resources Group provided a PowerPoint presentation regarding the ongoing update to the Historic Resources survey. She provided a background of the survey efforts and the methodologies of the survey work completed to date. Ms. Lazaretto is recommending 29 historic districts with 750 contributors, 24 special planning features, 46 properties of significance, and 11 planning districts. There are over 400 individual properties not contributing to a district. She explained the reasons for her recommendations which are based on updated professional standards and the new City-wide Historic Context Statement.

Commissioners thanked Ms. Lazaretto and her colleagues for their work on this survey update.

Commissioner Gallatin made some suggestions about using graphics to illustrate some of the information in the presentation.

Mr. Mayer responded to Commissioner Gallatin's question about outreach stating that there will be ads in the newspaper, social media, and notice to the South Pasadena Preservation Foundation.

**CONTINUED
APPLICATIONS**

3. None.

NEW ITEMS

4. **1504 Mission Street**
Applicant: Ryan Ramirez, Business Owner
Project number: 1956-COA
Historic Status Code: 5D3

Project Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the approval of a sidewalk board sign. The sign is 2' x 3'; A-frame wood sign with Coffee on it.

Presentation:

Ryan Ramirez presented his project and responded to questions about the drawings and the location of the proposed sign on the sidewalk.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Discussion/Decision:

Motion/Second (Friedman/Gallatin) to **APPROVE** the project.

The motion carried 4-0, Howell-Ardila absent.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 1504 Mission Street as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would continue to meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

5. 1811 Diamond Avenue

Applicant: Nathan Sewell, Designer

Project number: 1963-COA

Historic Status Code: 5D3

Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a 454 sq. ft. single story addition and a new 454 sq. ft. second story addition to an existing 1,456 sq. ft. single story English Revival house on a 10,859 sq. ft. lot. The second story addition will consist of: a new master bedroom, a sitting area with master closet, a master bathroom, and a balcony towards the rear elevation. The single story addition will consist of a new bathroom, a new bedroom and a sitting area. The exterior materials for the addition will match the existing and will consist of; wood windows, stucco siding, and composition asphalt shingles.

Presentation:

Nathan Sewell presented his project and responded to questions about the two site plans and the window schedule. Mr. Sewell confirmed that the railing would be metal. He would also edit the differences between the window schedule and the drawings.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Discussion/Decision:

Commissioner McLane said that the house has very elegant roof edge details; they are narrow and have a specific profile that is not shown in the drawings. Mr. McLane wants to see this detail in the drawings and that the

new roof will match that.

Motion/Second (McLane/Gallatin) to **APPROVE** the project with the following **CONDITION**: Prior to submitting plans to the Building Division for plan check, the applicant shall obtain Chair Review approval for the following: cross sectional details of the existing and proposed doors and windows demonstrating that the new doors and windows will match the existing, demonstrate that the new insulated glass units will fit within the traditional windows and maintain a traditional profile, lower the plate height on the roof of the addition to seven feet and maintaining the ridge height as shown and lowering the eave line by one foot, draw the roof edge details (both rake and eave) faithfully to the existing house, and show that the new roof matches those roof edge details.

This motion was made on the finding that the project is appropriate to the size, massing, and design context of the historic neighborhood. The addition provides a clear distinction between the new and historic elements. It adds substantial new living space while preserving the existing house and it enhances the appearance without affecting its original design, character, heritage, or prominent features.

The motion carried 4-0, Howell-Ardila absent.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City's Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 1811 Diamond Avenue as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

6. **1135 Diamond Avenue**
Applicant: Eddie Martinez
Project number: 1973-COA
Historic Status Code: 5D1

Description:

A request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a new 203 sq. ft. single story addition to an existing 680 sq. ft. single story Craftsman house on a 5,038 sq. ft. lot. The addition will consist of: expanding a bedroom, a kitchen, a new bathroom, and a new den. The exterior materials will consist of; wood windows, clapboard wood siding, and composition asphalt shingles.

Presentation:

Eddie Martinez presented his project and responded to questions about the roof shingles, the windows, roof configuration, windows, and the main

front door. Mr. Martinez clarified the following: dimensional asphalt shingles (shown on Sheet A2.2) would be used, vinyl and fiberglass windows would not be used; they will be wood windows. He also acknowledged that there are errors regarding the “key note” references. Mr. Martinez confirmed that the original front door would be refinished and not replaced.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Decision:

Motion/Second (McLane/De Young) to **APPROVE** the project with the following **CONDITION:** Prior to submitting plans to the Building Division for plan check, the applicant shall obtain Chair Review approval for the following: 1) demonstrate that the new windows will match the existing windows in form, material, and details; 2) modify the roof of the addition according to the Chair’s sketches (shown on Sheet E8-02); 3) notate the plans to indicate that the entry door will be preserved and refinished; 4) the site plan (Sheet T-1) a note in error will be changed to call out the walkway with Keynote 113 and remove Keynote 120 which points to the south edge of the driveway because it is not necessary.

This motion was made on the finding that the project is appropriate to the scale and design context of the neighborhood. The addition provides a clear distinction between the new and historic elements. It adds substantial new living space while preserving the existing house and it enhances the appearance without affecting its original design, character, heritage, or important features.

The motion carried 4-0, Howell-Ardila absent.

Upon consideration of the criteria identified in Section 2.64(b)(2) of the South Pasadena Municipal Code, Section 36.410.040 (required findings to approve the design review application, consideration of the application, and all written and oral testimony submitted, including the evaluation of the property by a qualified architectural historian and categorization of the property as set forth in the City’s Cultural Heritage Inventory, the Cultural Heritage Commission found and determined that 1135 Diamond Avenue as it exists, and as it is proposed to be altered, would reasonably meet national, state or local criteria for designation as a landmark or part of an historic district, and is exempt from CEQA under Class 31.

NEW BUSINESS

7. **709 Hermosa Street**
Conceptual Review
Applicants: Patrick Szurpicki

Description:

A request for a conceptual review for the construction of a 585 sq. ft. single story addition to a 1,565 sq. ft. single story Dutch Revival Farmhouse on a 12,542 sq. ft. lot.

Presentation:

Patrick Szurpicki presented his conceptual project and asked for comments on delineating between the new and existing. Also proposed is a metal roof for the house. Mr. Szurpicki suggested that the addition's differentiation could be achieved by exposing 6" of concrete footing, adjusting the roof pitch in the rear, and modifying the window design.

Commissioners agreed that the metal roof is not appropriate for the house, but may be used for the addition. The asphalt shingles are more in keeping with the design of the house. The steel door and window are secondary features and would be acceptable since they are at the rear.

Commissioner McLane noted that the profile of the proposed single glaze wood windows does not match the traditional windows. Mr. McLane suggested that Szurpicki work towards a contemporary contrasting character.

Commissioner Gallatin had questions about the details of the proposed skylight and detected an inconsistency with the lot size noted on the plans.

This item was for discussion purposes only; no decisions were made at this time.

8. **1746 and 1750 Hanscom Drive
Review of Architectural Historians Reports**

Description:

Peter Bakhtiari (property owner) is seeking approval to demolish a Spanish Colonial Revival style house (constructed in 1930) at 1746 Hanscom Drive and a Craftsman style house (constructed circa 1934) at 1750 Hanscom Drive. Mr. Bakhtiari would build two new homes on those sites.

The Commission reviewed the architectural historian's evaluation reports for each property. With respect to 1746 Hanscom Drive, Commissioners agreed that the property did not merit inclusion on the Inventory of Cultural Resources. However, Commissioners wanted to see more information about the front porch enclosure which the report considered a major alteration.

Commissioner Gallatin suggested that the architectural historian research the Los Angeles County records to determine whether additional permits or other information exists.

Commissioner McLane said that the front porch enclosure appears to be designed in the Craftsman style and he wants to know if it was enclosed within the period of historic significance.

9. **Commission Reorganization**

Nomination/Second (McLane/Friedman) elected Commissioner Howell-Ardila for Chair.

The motion carried 4-0, Howell-Ardila absent.

Nomination/Second (Friedman/De Young) elected Commissioner Gallatin for Vice Chair.

The motion carried 4-0, Howell-Ardila absent.

COMMUNICATIONS

10. **Comments from Council Liaison:**

None

11. **Comments from Commission**

Commissioners McLane and De Young expressed their thanks and appreciation to the other Commissioners and staff for their time and contribution to the Commission.

Commissioner Friedman provided an update regarding the San Pascual Stables subcommittee. He reported that consultant Ron Hagan was retained to tour the site and prepare recommendations for the future lease.

12. **Comments from Staff**

Staff thanked Commissioners McLane and De Young for their time and expertise on the Commission. Mr. Mayer spoke about a project on Buena Vista Street that involved demolition of an old home (not on the inventory) that went through the Design Review Board process. He also announced that the start of the General Plan and Mission Street Specific Plan updates that are underway and that the staff is seeking volunteers to participate on an Advisory Committee and Focus Groups.

MINUTES

13. **Minutes of the regular meeting of November 17, 2016**

Motion/Second (McLane/DeYoung) to **APPROVE** the minutes.

14. **Minutes of the regular meeting of December 15, 2016**

Motion/Second (McLane/DeYoung) to **APPROVE** the minutes with a minor edits.

ADJOURNMENT

15. **Meeting Adjourned at 8:35 p.m. to the next regular meeting scheduled for February 16, 2017.**

Deborah Howell-Ardila

Deborah Howell-Ardila, Chair

16 Feb 2017

Date