

**MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE  
CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION**

CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA

**CONVENED THIS 20<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF DECEMBER, 2018**

AMEDEE O. "DICK" RICHARDS, JR. CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
1424 MISSION STREET

**ROLL CALL**

The meeting convened at: 6:50 pm  
Commissioners Present: Mark Gallatin (Chair), William Cross, Kristin Morrish  
Commissioners Absent: Rebecca Thompson, Victor Holz  
Council Liaison: Michael A. Cacciotti, Councilmember (absent)  
Staff Liaison Present: Darby Whipple, Senior Planner

*Please Note: These Minutes are a summary of the meetings and are not a fully transcribed record. An audio recording of the meeting can be made available upon request with the City Clerk's Office.*

**PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD**

1. NONE

**CONSENT CALENDAR**

2. **2024 Maycrest (Notice of Intent to Demolish)**

***Applicant: Mike Geragos***

***Project No.: 2081-NID-DRX***

***Year Built: 1951***

***Historic District: N/A***

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will consider a request for approval of a proposal to demolish an existing 405 sq. ft. two vehicle garage. The existing structure is a 1,501 sq. ft. single story house located on a 7,505 sq. ft. lot. An Architectural Historian has provided an Historic Evaluation Report and has determined that the structure is not eligible as a designated Historic Resource. The Commission will review and validate the findings of the report in relationship to the proposed demolition as required for all structures proposed for demolition that are at least 45 years old and not currently on the City's Historic Inventory. If the CHC finds that the structure is not eligible as a Historic Resource, the project will proceed to the Design Review Board for the proposed replacement construction of a new 470 sq. ft. detached two vehicle garage and a 1,097 sq. ft. second story addition. The CHC will not be approving the proposed house addition and the new garage, only the demolition of the existing garage.

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

None

**Public Comment:**

None

**Decision: (BOTH ITEMS)**

Commissioner Morrish: Made a motion to APPROVE both CONSENT Items as requested.

Commissioner Gallatin: Seconded the Motion

**APPROVED (Recommended to DRB)**

(Ayes: 3; No: 0), 2 Absent.

**3. 1422 Alhambra Road (Notice of Intent to Demolish)**

**Applicant: James Fenske**

**Project No.: 2179-NID-DRX**

**Year Built: 1923**

**Historic District: N/A**

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will consider a request for a CHC consent approval for a proposal to demolish an existing 400 square foot detached two-car garage and significant alteration to the existing single-family home. The primary residential structure consists of an existing single-story Craftsman-Style home of approximately 1,382 square feet. The applicant is proposing to add a second story to the residence, and construct a new detached 500 square foot garage. The new second floor addition will be 977 square feet for a total of 2,359 square feet for the primary structure. Additionally, the applicant is proposing a façade change to convert the architectural styling to a Mediterranean style architecture. An Architectural Historian has provided an Historic Evaluation Report and has determined that the structure is not eligible as a designated Historic Resource. The Commission will review and validate the findings of the report for the purposes of the proposed demolition as required for all structures proposed for demolition that are at least 45 years old and not currently on the City's Historic Inventory. **If the CHC approves of the demolition, the project will proceed to the Design Review Board for the proposed addition and façade change subject to compliance with current City Zoning standards. The CHC will not be approving the proposed house addition and the new garage, only the demolition of the existing garage.**

**The item has been requested to be CONTINUED to the January 17, 2019 CHC meeting.**

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

None

**Public Comment:**

None

**Decision:**

Commissioner Morrish: Made a motion to APPROVE both CONSENT Items as requested.

Commissioner Gallatin: Seconded the Motion

**CONTINUED to the January 17, 2019 CHC meeting.**

(Ayes: 3; No: 0), 2 Absent.

## CONTINUED ITEMS

### 4. 1314 Stratford Avenue

**Applicant:** Thomas Agius

**Project No:** 2166-COA

**Year Built:** 1914

**Architectural Style:** Craftsman

**Historic Status Code:** 5D1

**Historic District:** Marengo School Craftsman District (Potential District)

#### **Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review a request for the proposal for a 135 single story and new 954 second story addition to an existing 1,664 sq. ft. single story Craftsman style house on a 7,915 sq. ft. lot. The single story addition will consist of a family room and bedroom. The second story addition will consist of a bedroom, a bathroom, a master bedroom, master bathroom, and two closets. The exterior materials for the addition will match the existing house materials. A 105 sq. ft. addition is proposed to the existing 336 sq. ft. detached garage. The new garage size will be 500 sq. ft. The exterior materials for the garage addition will match the existing.

**The item has been requested to be CONTINUED to the January 17, 2019 CHC meeting.**

#### **Presentation:**

None

#### **Public Comment:**

None

#### **Commission Discussion:**

None

#### **Decision:**

Commissioner Morrish: Made a motion to CONTINUE both Items as requested.

Commissioner Cross: Seconded the motion

**CONTINUED to the January 17, 2019 CHC meeting**

(Ayes: 3; No: 0), 2 Absent.

### 5. 1919 Marengo Avenue

**Applicant:** Kyle Imoto

**Project No:** 2157-COA

**Year Built:** 1910

**Architectural Style:** Craftsman

**Historic Status Code:** 5D1

**Historic District:** La France Craftsman District (Potential District)

#### **Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review a request for the proposal for a 365 single story and new 773 second story addition to an existing 1,487 sq. ft. single story Craftsman style house on a 7,511 sq. ft. lot. The single story addition will consist of a great room. The second story addition will consist of two

bedrooms, a bathroom, a master bedroom, master bathroom, a master closet, and a laundry area. The exterior materials for the addition will match the existing house materials. The proposed windows and doors for the addition will consist of Fibrex materials.

**The item has been requested to be CONTINUED.**

**Decision:**

Commissioner Morrish: Made a motion to CONTINUE both Items as requested.

Commissioner Cross: Seconded the motion

**CONTINUED**

(Ayes: 3; No: 0), 2 Absent.

**NEW ITEMS**

**6. 1307 Diamond Avenue**

***Applicant: George A. Renville***

***Project No: 1948-COA***

***Year Built: 1927***

***Architectural Style: Spanish Colonial Revival***

***Historic Status Code: 4X***

***Historic District: El Cerrito Circle District (Potential District)***

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review a request for the proposal for a new 441 sq. ft. detached two vehicle garage to an existing 2,169 sq. ft. two story Spanish Colonial Revival style house on a 7,521 sq. ft. lot. The existing chimney will be demolished and rebuilt. The chimney will be built closer to the house, allowing greater access for the existing driveway. The new chimney will match the existing. The exterior materials for the garage addition will match the existing house.

**Applicant Presentation:**

Mr. Renville summarized previous demolition of garage and retaining walls, proposed new garage and alteration to existing changes.

**Commission Questions:**

Commissioner Gallatin clarified new retaining walls are adjacent to landscaped areas and southwest corner of site CMU wall to be replaced. Additionally clarified that garage door will be wood plank, roof tiles will be barrel tiles, rafter tails and stucco will match existing.

**Public Comments:**

No Public Comments.

**Commission Discussion:**

None

**Decision:**

Commissioner Gallatin: Made a motion to APPROVE the project with Conditions:

- Garage door will be wood
- Roof tiles will be barrel tiles
- Rafter tails and stucco will match existing
- Garage Light Fixture will be submitted for Chair Review for approval

---

The project meets Specific Findings #6, #7, and #8

Commissioner Cross: Seconded the motion.

**APPROVED**

(Ayes: 3; No: 0), 2 Absent.

**7. 1848 Oxley Street**

***Applicant: Peter Benoit***

***Project No: 2176-COA***

***Year Built: 1922***

***Architectural Style: English Revival***

***Historic Status Code: 5D1***

***Historic District: SE Mission Craftsman District (Potential District)***

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review a request for the proposal for two additions. The first addition is 196 sq. ft. single story addition on the rear elevation of the house. The addition will consist of a new family room with a breezeway. The second addition is new 386 sq. ft. single story addition with a new 315 sq. ft. second floor study area, both are located towards the rear of the property. The single story addition consist of a new master bedroom with a master bathroom. The total new additional square footage is 1,045 sq. ft. The existing house is a 1,298 sq. ft. single story English Revival house on a 6,742 sq. ft. lot. A 190 sq. ft. addition will be removed. A new 208 sq. ft. single vehicle carport is proposed attached to the existing garage. The exterior materials for the addition will consist of weathered cedar clapboards and trim with grey asphalt roof shingles.

**Applicant Presentation:**

Applicant Peter Benoit introduced Bill Young (owner) and summarized plans

**Commission Questions:**

Commissioner Cross asked about existing fence. It was explained that fences are not part of the Commission's purview. Applicant noted that a repair only is prescribed for fence.

Commissioner Gallatin asked for clarification of how the 1945 addition has not gained historic significance and is not character defining. The applicant described the poor quality of the construction, flat low roof and that the space would remain without cover as an open patio.

**Public Comments:**

Jan Bessinger voiced general concerns about view from street and windows looking over neighbors. Monica Kelly voiced concern about impacts of allowed construction hours and impacts on shared drive.

**Commission Discussion:**

Commissioner Gallatin clarified with City Attorney that construction hours are governed by City Ordinance and not specifically added to a project. Additionally asked for clarity on the height of the project impacting the solar installation on neighbor. Lastly asked about the use of skylights (pg 27 design guidelines) that are visible from public way. Clarity was provided on "clad" windows with true divided lights being preferred by commission and applicant.

**Decision:**

Commissioner Gallatin: Made a motion to APPROVE the project with Condition:

- Doors and windows be clad with true divided lights
- The project meets Specific Findings #1, #2, and #3

Commissioner Morrish: Seconded the motion.

**APPROVED**

(Ayes: 3; No: 0). 2 Absent.

**8. 621 Milan Avenue**

**Applicant: Steve Dahl**

**Project No: 2182-COA**

**Year Built: 1924**

**Architectural Style: English Revival**

**Historic Status Code: 5D1**

**Historic District: North Milan District (Potential District)**

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review a request for a proposal for a 568 sq. ft. single story addition to an existing 1,647 sq. ft. single story English Revival house on a 8,260 sq. ft. lot. The addition is located towards the rear of the property and consists of a new master bedroom with master bathroom. A 18 sq. ft. addition is proposed on north side elevation, creating a new bedroom. A new bay window is proposed in bedroom number 3. The exterior materials for the addition will match the existing and will consist of stucco siding, wood windows and asphalt roof shingles.

**Applicant Presentation:**

Architect, Steve Dahl, for applicants, presented a description of the construction plan.

**Public Comment:**

No public comment.

**Commission Questions:**

Commissioner Cross asked about design of 2 bedrooms vs three. Mr. Dahl explained that a 3<sup>rd</sup> bedroom was gained by pushing out the middle section slightly. Additionally expressed concern about the protection of the Ginko tree which is covered by tree ordinance and a volunteered condition by the applicant.

Commissioner Gallatin asked for clarity on the dormers being decorative or for ventilation and if exposed rafter tails would remain. Additionally noted that porch expansion although front changes not recommended in this instance would be reversible. Mr. Dahl explained that new dormers will match existing; dormers will allow additional ventilation for attic storage.

**Commission Discussion:**

No further discussion.

**Decision:**

Commissioner Cross: Made a motion to APPROVE the project with Conditions

- The rafter tails will match the existing
- The Ginko tree will be protected or replaced if damaged; replaced with a 24" box tree.  
(\*volunteered by applicant)

The project meets Specific Findings #2, #5 and #6

---

Commissioner Morrish: Seconded the motion.

(Ayes: 3; No: 0), 2 Absent

### Discussion Items

9. The commission will discuss a potential historic district near Raymond Hill (South of Grevelia St, bordered by Brent Ave, Park Ave, encompassing Palermo Ln) The area is identified as 1940's apartment district.

#### CONTINUED

10. **1228 Milan Avenue**

***Applicant: Susan Masterman***

***Project No.: 2198-COA-MOD***

***Year Built: 1917***

***Architectural Style: Craftsman/Mission***

***Historic Status Code: 4D2***

***Historic District: Tracts 2071 & 1197 District (Potential District)***

**Project Description:**

The applicant is requesting feedback from the Commission regarding a modification to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness (2121-COA, May 2018). The applicant is proposing to square off the second story addition with a 240 square foot bedroom addition. The project, as previously approved, is currently in the construction framing stages.

**This is for discussion purposes only, no decision will be made at this time.**

**Applicant Presentation:**

Applicant Susan Masterman presented a description of the current construction plan, previously approved, and the proposed changed to include a 240 square foot second story bedroom addition reframed with tiled hip roof and that the first floor additions be reframed with tiled shed roof off the rear. Lastly that the master bedroom addition roof be changed to a tiled hip roof from previously approved parapet wall on flat roof.

**Commission Questions:**

Commissioner Gallatin clarified that "existing" on drawings indicate the current approved condition; requested that "prior" conditions be also shown in comparison.

### COMMUNICATIONS

**11. COMMENTS FROM COUNCIL LIASON:**

No comments.

**12. COMMENTS FROM COMMISSION:**

Commissioner Gallatin: Thanked staff (Jose Villegas) for the inclusion of permit history and asked for Sanborn Maps to include date.

**13. COMMENTS FROM SOUTH PASADENA PRESERVATION FOUNDATION (SPPF)**

Commissioner Gallatin: SPPF launched a membership recruitment that was successful. Annual membership is \$25/year. Look for upcoming fundraisers, a church tour in May.

**14. COMMENTS FROM STAFF:**

Staff reminded the Commission that a Chair appointment needs to be considered before the regular March meeting.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

15. No review of minutes.

**ADJOURNMENT**

16. The meeting adjourned at 8:40 pm to the next regularly scheduled meeting on January 17, 2018.

APPROVED,



February 22, 2019