

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE  
**CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION**

CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA

CONVENED THIS 16<sup>TH</sup> DAY OF AUGUST, 2018

AMEDEE O. "DICK" RICHARDS, JR. CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
1424 MISSION STREET

**ROLL CALL**

The meeting convened at: 6:50 pm  
Commissioners Present: Mark Gallatin (Chair), Rebecca Thompson, Victor Holz, Deborah Howell-Ardila  
Commissioners Absent: Steve Friedman (Vice-Chair)  
Council Liaison: Michael A. Cacciotti, Councilmember (absent)  
Staff Liaison Present: Darby Whipple, Senior Planner

*Please Note: These Minutes are a summary of the meetings and are not a fully transcribed record.  
An audio recording of the meeting can be made available upon request with the City Clerk's Office.*

**PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD**

1. NONE

**CONSENT CALENDAR**

2. 92 Pinecrest Drive (Notice of Intent to Demolish)

*Applicant: Steve Laub*

*Project No.: 2024-NID-DRX*

*Year Built: 1959*

*Historic District: N/A*

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will consider a request for a CHC consent approval for a proposal to demolish an existing single-family hillside residence. The existing structure currently consists of 1,125 square feet and was constructed in 1959 and it sits on a 4,799 square foot parcel. An Architectural Historian has provided an Historic Evaluation Report and has determined that the structure is not eligible as a designated Historic Resource. The Commission will review and validate the findings of the report for the purposes of the proposed demolition as required for all structures proposed for demolition that are at least 45 years old and not currently on the City's Historic Inventory. If the CHC finds that the structure is not eligible as a Historic Resource, the project will proceed to the Design Review Board for the proposed replacement construction of a two-story 1,678 square foot square foot single-family residence 1,322 square foot basement subject to compliance with current City Zoning standards and environmental review. The CHC will not be approving the proposed house with attached garage, only the demolition of the existing house with attached carport.

**Public Comment:**

Gary Cavafian (84 Pinecrest Dr) – Expressed concern about existing retaining wall and if it will be replaced, also concerned about dust control and window location.

Applicant (Steve Laub) noted that the engineer of record would be on the project and that the project would follow DRB and permit requirements.

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Gallatin: Clarification that homes 45yrs and older come before CHC to determine IF historic in nature. Design review is the responsibility of the DRB.

Commissioner Howell-Ardila: Noted that the Historic Resource Evaluation (HRE-Architect’s Report) does not address the context statements, report seems to be opinion based rather than specific to standards.

Charles Fisher (Architectural Historian) – acknowledges that report is not complete.

Commissioners Gallatin and Howell-Ardila - Suggestion that Historian work with Staff to follow template for re-write through chair review.

**Decision:**

Commissioner Holz made a motion for a finding that the structure is not significant with Conditions:

- That the HRE be rewritten and approved through Chair Review

Commissioner Howell-Ardila seconded the motion.

***APPROVED***

(Ayes: 4; No: 0), 1 Absent.

**CONTINUED ITEMS**

**3. 1963 La France Avenue**

***Applicant: Charles Yu***

***Project No: 2091-COA***

***Year Built: 1909***

***Architectural Style: Mission Revival***

***Historic Status Code: 5D1***

***Historic District: La France Craftsman District (Potential District)***

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will consider a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a proposal for 456.50 sq. ft. single story addition and a new 384.25 sq. ft. second story addition to an existing 2,188 sq. ft., two story Mission Revival style house on an 8,662 sq. ft. lot. The single story addition will consist of a living room and a bedroom. The second story addition will consist of a bedroom with a bathroom. A 123 sq. ft. second story deck is proposed on the rear elevation. All of the proposed additions are located on the rear elevation. The exterior materials for the additions will match the existing. The materials will consist of stucco siding, flat roof, and vinyl windows.

Applicant Charles Yu: Noted changes to previous submittal including additional setback, noted that former “filled-in” windows would not be resurrected.

**Public Comment:**

NONE

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Howell-Ardila – Noted concern about additional extension of the rear addition which is further from original design and clarify that the addition is subordinate.

Charles Yu – Expressed concern about altering the plans further, currently following advice of Chair Review and Staff.

Commissioner Gallatin – Clarified that advice at counter did not distinguish the addition as historic so not critical to setback, but better understands the request to differentiate. Also noted required corrections to drawing sheets.

Commissioner Thompson – Noted that setting the addition back further might lead to a poor addition, also noted unbalanced fenestration and corrections to drawings.

**Decision:**

Commissioner Howell-Ardila made a motion to **CONTINUE** the project:  
Commissioner Thompson seconded the motion.

***CONTINUED***

(Ayes: 4; No: 0), 1 Absent.

**4. 1014 Milan Avenue**

***Applicant: D’Anna Marie Olsen, Designer***

***Project No: 2096-COA***

***Year Built: 1896***

***Architectural Style: Craftsman***

***Historic Status Code: 5D1***

***Historic District: Southeast Mission Craftsman District (Potential District)***

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will consider a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for an 848.44 sq. ft. addition to an existing 1,452.60 Craftsman style house on a 8,500 sq. ft. lot. The two additions will be: a new 445.98 sq. ft. second story addition and a 402.46 sq. ft. single story addition. The second story addition will consist of two bedrooms and a bath room. The single story addition consists of a new den and new laundry room. The exterior materials will consist of new wood side shingles, Hardy Board panel siding, wood windows, and composition roof shingle, matching the existing.

Applicant Olsen noted changes made as requested by commission including updating casement windows and provided options for columns at porch.

**Public Comment:**

NONE

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Thompson noted the redesign is much improved, commented on column design.

Commissioner Howell-Ardila commented on the roofline being a defining characteristic and if changing it is necessary. Changes move away from existing historic character, if not able to lower then it should not happen.

Commissioner Gallatin suggested improvements to drawings to show differentiated siding on addition.

Owner and Applicant described that request to keep roof height as proposed to allow for usability of interior space.

**Decision:**

Commissioner Gallatin made a motion to APPROVE the project with Conditions:

- That the plate height of second floor be lowered and junction of roofs be reconciled and approved at Chair Review.

The project meets Specific Findings #2, #3, and #5

Commissioner Howell-Ardila seconded the motion.

***APPROVED***

(Ayes: 4; No: 0), 1 Absent.

**5. 1005-1007 Fair Oaks Avenue**

***Applicant: Steve Dahl, Architect***

***Project No: 2137-COA***

***Year Built: 1934***

***Architectural Style: Vernacular***

***Historic Status Code: 5D3***

***Historic District: 1000 Block Fair Oaks District (Potential District)***

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will consider a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the proposed façade change and restoration to the existing vernacular commercial building. New stucco siding and tile with two new signs are proposed. The front sign will say “Mamma’s Brickoven Pizza and Pasta”. The total sq. ft. of the sign will be 38 sq. ft. An existing “Mamma’s Brickoven Pizza and Pasta” is proposed on the rear elevation of the building. The total sq. ft. will 28 sq. ft. The signs will be red and illuminated. The materials for the signs will be plastic.

Commissioner Thompson recused for proximity to project.

Applicant Steve Dahl gave a summary of the project, noting 3 Chair Reviews, provided additional historic research and permit history. Responding to crowded signage, proposing abbreviating sign to “Mamma’s”, may also not expose transom windows to provide additional room; however will make attempt to expose historic windows

**Public Comment:**

NONE

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Howell-Ardila noted that transom windows should be replaced, but not with modern windows. Also noted that sign may still be too large and should be considered with signage permit package.

Commissioner Gallatin asked for clarification on outdoor dining stanchions being temporary and other corrections to drawings.

Applicant Dahl noted that the transom are currently visible from inside, the stanchions will be temporary, but marked for placement and that historically the building was painted front and rear.

**Decision:**

Commissioner Howell-Ardila made a motion to APPROVE the project with Conditions:

- That transom windows be restored vs replaced, if exposed in place.
- “Mamma’s” sign at front should be scaled to allow 6” from top and bottom subject to Chair Review

The project meets Specific Findings #1, #2, and #4

Commissioner Holz seconded the motion.

***APPROVED***

(Ayes: 3; No: 0), 1 Absent, 1 recused.

**NEW ITEMS**

6. **NONE**

**Discussion Items**

7. **1954 Milan Avenue (CONCEPTUAL REVIEW)**

***Applicant: Scott Brown***

***Year Built: 1910***

***Architectural Style: Craftsman***

***Historic Status Code: 5D1***

***Historic District: South Milan District (Potential)***

**Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will discuss a conceptual review item for a 433 sq. ft. single story addition, a new 600 sq. ft. detached garage with an attached 200 sq. ft. pool house. An existing 462 sq. ft. accessory structure will be demolished.

Applicant, Scott Brown, gave a summary of the project including noting the changes over time made to the property. Noting that all windows will be re-used and interior molding will be matched.

**This item is for discussion purposes only; no decision shall be made at this time.**

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Gallatin asked what was differentiated on the addition and if accessory structure will be ADU. Also questioned staff on building requirements for openings adjacent to property lines.

Commissioner Thompson asked for clarification on floorplan.

Commissioner Howell-Ardila requested for study of historic garage and report on structural stability.

Applicant noted that layout was request by owner to accommodate internal flow. The out building is not structurally sound and therefore needs to be replaced and will be act as a pool house only. The teahouse design is differentiated from the design of the main house, but very much in keeping with the period.

**8. 1017 Avon Place (CONCEPTUAL REVIEW)**

**Applicant: Mark Ng**

**Year Built: 1911**

**Architectural Style: Craftsman**

**Historic Status Code: 5D1**

**Historic District: 1000 Block Avon District (Potential District)**

**Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will discuss a conceptual review item for a 402 sq. ft. single story addition to an existing 1,512 sq. ft. single story Craftsman style house on a 6,750 sq. ft. lot.

**This item is for discussion purposes only; no decision shall be made at this time.**

Applicant Mark Ng gave a summary of the project.

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Gallatin asked how the addition would be differentiated and requested the reuse of existing windows.

Commissioner Thompson requested that the drawings accurately represent the type of windows and other layout details be studied.

Applicant explained that the addition would be considerably smaller and the roofline would be inset. The existing windows are jalousie and not being re-used.

9. **1101 and 1107 Mission Street | “Mission Bell” (CONCEPTUAL REVIEW)**

**Applicant:** Dwight Bond (Workshop Design Collective)

**Year Built:** 1921 and 1978

**Architectural Style:** Vernacular

**Historic Status Code:** 5S2

**Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will discuss a conceptual review for a proposed mix-use development project.

**This item is for discussion purposes only; no decision shall be made at this time.**

Staff introduced the project and outlined the future project track

Dwight Bond summarized the evolution and design of the project.

Margarita Jarabek (Architectural Historian) reviewed the Historic Resource Evaluation giving summary of condition of the building, noting disagreement between DPR forms and Historic Inventory designating the building as (6L).

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Howell-Ardila expressed concern that CEQA process consider any “significant adverse impacts” and if necessary consider EIR to provide alternatives.

Commissioner Gallatin in reference to ESA report noted improvements. Also questioned if “6L” was actually an historic resource, vs study for Inventory to include the property on inventory and mentioned in Specific Plan. Also asked if the presentation has been to South Pasadena Preservation Foundation.

Commissioner Thompson noted the design has lots of features and suggested simplification.

10. **1115 El Centro Street | South Pasadena Library**

**Landmark Nomination for the Library Tree (Subcommittee Report to Commission)**

**Applicant:** Library Director, Steve Fjeldsted

**Project No.:** 2155-LHD

**Year Planted:** 1930

**Natural Feature:** Moreton Bay Fig Tree

**Historic Status Code:** N/A

**Historic District:** Library Neighborhood (Potential District)

**Description:**

The appointed Subcommittee will present their report to the full Commission in their support of the nomination of the Moreton Bay Fig Tree (Library Tree) as a South Pasadena Historic Landmark. The Commission will determine the course of action upon review of the Subcommittee’s report findings. If the Commission determines the nomination shall move forward, the Commission may schedule the formal recommendation to Council at the next scheduled CHC meeting, pursuant to a 20-day notice. The existing

tree is located at the South Pasadena Library, on the west elevation of the Community Room facing Diamond Ave.

**The Subcommittee will make a recommendation to the full Commission on whether to advance the nomination. A formal recommendation/decision on the Landmark nomination will be scheduled for the next CHC meeting subject to a Motion made by the CHC.**

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioners Holz and Thompson, as subcommittee, reported on the application review.

**11. 320 Grand Avenue | Koebig House (Landmark Nomination)**

**Applicant: William and Teresa Sherman, Owners**

**Project No.: 2123-LHD**

**Year Built: 1927**

**Architectural Style: English Tudor Revival**

**Historic Status Code: 2B2**

**Historic District: Grand Avenue North (Potential District)**

**Description:**

The appointed Subcommittee will present their report to the full Commission in their support of the nomination of the Koebig House (320 Grand Ave) as a South Pasadena Historic Landmark. The Commission will determine the course of action upon review of the Subcommittee's report findings. If the Commission determines the nomination shall move forward, the Commission may schedule the formal recommendation to Council as the next scheduled CHC meeting, pursuant to a 20-day notice. The home was designed by architect H. Roy Kelley, in the English Tudor Revival style and was built in 1927-1928. The original owner was Walter C.S. Koebig, a prominent orthopedic surgeon in California.

**The Subcommittee will make a recommendation to the full Commission on whether to advance the nomination. A formal recommendation/decision on the Landmark nomination will be scheduled for the next CHC meeting subject to a Motion made by the CHC.**

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioners Gallatin and Thompson, as subcommittee, reported on the application review.

**COMMUNICATIONS**

**12. COMMENTS FROM COUNCIL LIASON:**

- NONE

**13. COMMENTS FROM COMMISSION:**

- Additional comments on Mission Bell presentation regarding public input process
- Discussion regarding complaints about 325 Oaklawn Ave Administrative Modification approval.

**14. COMMENTS FROM SOUTH PASADENA PRESERVATION FOUNDATION (SPPF):**

- No Meeting in July, although continuing to work with City on 710 EIR

**15. COMMENTS FROM STAFF:**

- NONE



## APPROVAL OF MINUTES

16. Minutes of the Regular Meeting from April 19, 2018 Meeting
17. Minutes of the Regular Meeting from March 15, 2018 Meeting
18. Minutes of the Regular Meeting from February 15, 2018 Meeting

**Decision:**

Commissioner Thompson made a motion to APPROVE  
Commissioner Gallatin seconded the motion.

***APPROVED***

(Ayes: 4; No: 0), 1 Absent

## ADJOURNMENT

19. The meeting adjourned at 11:00pm to a regular meeting on September 20, 2018.

APPROVED,



Mark Gallatin  
Chair, Cultural Heritage Commission

Date: April 18, 2019