

MINUTES OF THE SPECIAL MEETING OF THE  
**CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION**

CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA

CONVENED THIS 21<sup>ST</sup> DAY OF MARCH, 2019

AMEDEE O. "DICK" RICHARDS, JR. CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS  
1424 MISSION STREET

**ROLL CALL**

The meeting convened at: 8:03 pm

Commissioners Present: Mark Gallatin (Chair), Rebecca Thompson (Vice Chair), Steve Friedman, William Cross, Kristin Morrish

Commissioners Absent:

Council Liaison: Robert Joe, Councilmember (absent)

Staff Present: Teresa Highsmith, City Attorney  
Edwar Sissi, Associate Planner

*Please Note: These Minutes are a summary of the meetings and are not a fully transcribed record.  
An audio recording of the meeting can be made available upon request with the City Clerk's Office.*

**PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD**

1. NONE

**CONSENT CALENDAR**

2. NONE

**CONTINUED ITEMS**

3. NONE

**NEW ITEMS**

4. 1036 Adelaine Avenue  
*Applicant: Jim Fenske*  
*Project No: 1986-COA*  
*Year Built: 1889*  
*Architectural Style: Craftsman*  
*Historic Status Code: 5D1.*

*Historic District: El Centro/Indiana/Palm Addition*

**Project Description:**

Previously the CHC, at the March 16, 2017 meeting, approved the rehabilitation of the existing historic house (constructed in 1898), 14’x20’ detached garage (constructed in 1921) and 182 sq. ft. single story addition with a 292 sq. ft. second story addition. During construction the existing garage was demolished without City approvals. Now, the property owner is seeking CHC approval to rebuild the existing garage with the same design, dimensions (14’x20’) with similar materials. The approved square footage for the addition is less than 50% of the existing house, therefore a single vehicle garage is permitted.

Applicant Jim Fenske (Architect): noted the unfortunate nature of construction and having contractors understand the importance of saving historic structures. He noted that the plans noted the garage was to be salvaged and not demolished. The contractors however demolished the garage without permits and the owner is asking to obtain a CofA to rebuild the garage like for like.

**Public Comment:**

None

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Thompson: inquired what materials will be used and if he would consider carriage style doors.

Fenske: noted it will have TM Cobb wood windows and doors, wood siding, and same scale. The only noticeable new construction will be the framing, but open to provide carriage style doors.

Commissioner Gallatin: inquired with Staff for clarity on the project staff report that references the Secretary of the Interior Standards which stipulate recreation of the historic fabric, but the standards for rehabilitation call for differentiation.

Sissi: noted that there are conflicting dualities of the standards, however the Commission can condition the exact replication, or allow for consistency with the original, and allow for differentiation.

Highsmith: noted that the Secretary of Interior Standards for reconstruction are typically applied to Landmarks, not general historic fabric.

Commissioner Cross: noted that the proportions of the original massing are there, and expressed his approval of the garage reconstruction.

**Decision:**

Commissioner Morrish: Made a motion to APPROVE the project with Conditions:

- To change the garage doors to a carriage-type door.

The project meets Specific Findings #2, #7, and #8

Commissioner Friedman: Seconded the motion.

***APPROVED***

(Ayes: 5; No: 0), 0 Absent.

**5. 1959 Marengo Avenue**

***Applicant: Denise C. Tomlan***

***Project No.: 1903-COA***

***Year Built: 1912***

***Architectural Style: Craftsman***

***Historic Status Code: 5D1***

***Historic District: La France Craftsman District (Potential)***

**Project Description:**

The Cultural Heritage Commission will review the proposal for a 299 sq. ft. single story addition with a 231 sq. ft. second story addition to an existing 2,112 sq. ft. two story Craftsman house on a 7,500 sq. ft. lot. The single story addition will consist of adding a new breakfast nook, a new family room, and a bathroom with a new mudroom. The second story addition will consist of a new master bathroom and a new master bedroom with a new 84 sq. ft. second story deck. The exterior materials for the additions will match the existing house. The materials will consist of: Kiln-Dried cedar corbels, Kiln-Dried cedar siding shingles, and wood windows. A new asphalt solar reflective shingle roof is proposed for the entire house. An existing 312 sq. ft. accessory structure will be converted to a 312 sq. ft. patio cover.

Applicant Denise Tomlan (Architect): noted the proposed additions and reconfiguration of the interior layout of the existing house to accommodate the growing family's needs. The existing second story addition is inconsistent with the historic fabric, and the new proposed second story addition will be compatible and provide better interior flow and architectural detailing.

**Public Comment:**

None

**Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Morrish: inquired if the roof was being replaced with solar shingles, if the front is being touched, and for clarity on the kiln-dried shingles

Tomlan: the roof will be cool-roof, not solar shingles; kiln-dried is industry standard to ensure the shingles do not have excess moisture, and no changes will be made to the front.

Commissioner Thompson: asked for clarity on the color of the windows, and if proposing different windows.

Tomlan: noted that the colors represent a new color palette per the owner's request, but the windows are not being changed in style, all windows will match existing.

Commissioner Gallatin: noted discrepancies on the drawings.

Tomlan: the railing will be wood, the garage door will not be replaced. The wood grids on the new windows will match the existing as close as possible.

**Decision:**

Commissioner Friedman: Made a motion to APPROVE the project with Conditions:

- To provide cut sheets on the exterior light fixtures for chair review.

The project meets Specific Findings #2, #3, and #5

Commissioner Thompson: Seconded the motion.

***APPROVED***

(Ayes: 5; No: 0), 0 Absent.

## Discussion Items

### 6. 320 Grand Avenue – Mills Act Application Letter of Intent

*Applicant: Odom Stamps for the owner Dr. Sherman*

*Year Built: 1928*

*Architectural Style: Tudor*

*Historic Status Code: 2B2*

*Historic District/Landmark No.: Landmark No. 54*

#### **Project Description:**

The Commission will consider a Letter of Intent to enter into a Mills Act Contract for Landmark No. 54 (the Koebig House). The Commission may appoint a subcommittee to review this request and set up an on-site meeting to inspect the condition of the property and discuss any potential items for restoration that may be needed.

#### **Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Gallatin: inquired on the scope of work and noted that the roof repair was not included in the list of repairs, and knows that that is a recurring issue for this property.

Commissioner Thompson: noted the repair or replace notation of the exterior wood doors, and if they could be restored.

Stamps: noted the exterior wood doors are severely aged, and dried, but we included repair in the notation if they can be salvaged.

#### **Decision:**

Formation of the Subcommittee: Mark Gallatin and Rebecca Thompson.

### 7. Rollin Street Craftsman Cluster – District Nomination

*Project No.: 2114-LHD*

*Applicant: Odom Stamps*

#### **Project Description:**

The Commission will receive and file the Historic Assessment Report for the Rollin Craftsman Cluster district nomination. The established subcommittee will review the information and conduct their analysis to report back to the Commission.

Odom Stamps: noted the architectural historian has sourced the original permit records of the houses included in the proposed district and the records are available in the South Pasadena Library.

#### **Commission Comment and Discussion:**

Commissioner Thompson: noted some confusion of the proposed district, and 1501 Rollin.

Stamps: noted that 1501, and the proposed district boundary is based on the DPR form from 2002, but 1501 is the only non-contributor.

Commissioner Friedman: inquired why this district does not include additional properties, and if the five or six properties are the only properties listed in the original DPR form, and if there was a continuation sheet.

He inquired if the applicants can provide additional information on the district contributors, and if there are any others along Rollin, particularly 1425 Rollin Street.

Commissioner Cross: believes research needs to be done to see how the block was developed.

Commissioner Gallatin: noted the Commission's next steps as outlined in the Staff Report. The subcommittee is Cross and Thompson, as Cross was appointed during Friedman's time off from the Commission.

## COMMUNICATIONS

### 8. COMMENTS FROM COUNCIL LIASON:

No comments.

### 9. COMMENTS FROM COMMISSION:

No comments

### 10. COMMENTS FROM SOUTH PASADENA PRESERVATION FOUNDATION (SPPF):

Commissioner Gallatin: The SPPF would like to reinstate the Preservation Awards Program in conjunction with the CHC. Request to Staff: Place on next month's agenda, a discussion item to reinstate the Preservation Awards Program in conjunction with the SPPF.

### 11. COMMENTS FROM STAFF:

No comments.

## APPROVAL OF MINUTES

### 12. Minutes of the Regular Meeting for **February 21, 2019**.

#### Decision:

Commissioner Thompson: Made a motion to APPROVE with corrections:

- edit on page 5, change terminology to PUNCHED windows
- edits on additional pages (Gallatin).

Commissioner Morrish: Seconded the motion.

#### **APPROVED**

(Ayes: 5; No: 0), 0 Absent.

## ADJOURNMENT

### 13. The meeting adjourned at 8:55 pm to the next regularly scheduled meeting on April 18, 2019.

APPROVED,



\_\_\_\_\_  
Mark Gallatin  
Chair, Cultural Heritage Commission

\_\_\_\_\_  
April 18, 2019  
Date