

MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING OF THE
CULTURAL HERITAGE COMMISSION

CITY OF SOUTH PASADENA

Thursday May 16, 2019 at 6:45 P.M.

AMEDEE O. "DICK" RICHARDS, JR. CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
1424 MISSION STREET

ROLL CALL

The meeting convened at: 6:50 pm

Commissioners Present: Mark Gallatin (Chair), Rebecca Thompson (Vice Chair), Steve Friedman, William Cross, Kristin Morrish

Commissioners Absent:

Council Liaison: Robert Joe, Councilmember (Absent)

Staff Liaison Present: Darby Whipple, Senior Planner

*Please Note: These Minutes are a summary of the meetings and are not a fully transcribed record.
An audio recording of the meeting can be made available upon request with the City Clerk's Office.*

PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

1. NONE

CONSENT CALENDAR

2. **1312 Meridian Avenue (Notice of Intent to Demolish)**

Applicant: Melissa Hon

Project No.: 2205-NID-HDP

Year Built: 1926

Project Description:

The Cultural Heritage Commission considered a request for a CHC consent approval for a proposal to demolish an existing 104 square foot detached garage, and significant demolition to the existing 1,049 single-family hillside home. The applicant is proposing to construct a new 475 square foot attached garage, and construct a 139 square foot addition to the first floor, and construct a new second-story addition consisting of 648 square feet. A 50 square foot balcony is proposed on the rear second floor master bedroom addition. The exterior materials will consist of stucco, fiber cement board siding, asphalt roof shingles, and metal clad windows. Though the property is currently not on the City's Historic Inventory, an Architectural Historian has provided a Historic Evaluation Report and has determined that the structure is not eligible as a Historic Resource as outlined in the City's Cultural Heritage Ordinance. The Commission will review and validate the findings of the report for the purposes of the proposed demolition as required for all structures proposed for demolition that are at least 45 years old and not currently on the City's Historic Inventory. If the CHC approves of the demolition, the hillside project will proceed to the Planning Commission for the proposed addition subject to compliance with current City Zoning standards.

Melissa Hon (Architect) gave a brief introduction to the project and made herself available to answer questions about the report.

Commissioner Thompson pulled the item for discussion.

Commission Comment and Discussion:

Commissioner Thompson asked questions of the design choices.

Commissioner Gallatin questioned staff about the CHC's ability to make recommendations to the applicant or the Design Review Board.

Staff responded that the scope of the CHC's review is to validate the Historic Resource Evaluation report. That the criteria for design of this project are outlined in the design guidelines versus the Secretary of Interior Standards; however the commission could comment on the application although those inputs would be non-binding unless the project is determined to be historically significant.

Public Comment:

None

Decision:

Commissioner Morrish: Made a motion for a finding that the structure is not significant.

Commissioner Gallatin: Seconded the motion.

APPROVED

(Ayes: 5; No: 0), 0 Absent.

CONTINUED ITEMS

3. 1919 Marengo Avenue

Applicant: Kyle Imoto

Project No: 2157-COA

Year Built: 1910

Architectural Style: Craftsman

Historic Status Code: 5D1

Historic District: La France Craftsman District (Potential District)

Project Description:

The Cultural Heritage Commission considered a request for the proposal for a 365 square foot single story and new 773 square foot second story addition to an existing 1,487 square foot single story Craftsman style house on a 7,511 square foot lot. The first story addition will consist of a great room. The second story addition will consist of two bedrooms, a bathroom, a master suite with bedroom, bathroom and laundry area. The exterior materials for the addition will match the existing house materials. The proposed new windows and doors for the addition will consist of Fibrex materials.

Kyle Imoto (owner/architect) gave a summary of the project, noting that the proposed windows had been changed to Anderson E-series, vs the Millgard windows provided in the packet.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Comment and Discussion:

Commissioner Gallatin noted that he and Commissioner Morrish met with the applicant at Chair Review. Commissioner Thompson asked for details on the existing and proposed windows as it pertains to mullion dimensions. And clarified if the rear aluminum (right) window would be replaced; the applicant responded that they would consider that in the scope. Commissioner Friedman – clarified the number of windows at the rear first floor. Commissioner Cross questioned if the existing roof pitch 3/12 would be repeated on the proposed addition. The applicant confirmed it would. Commissioner Gallatin confirmed that the windows will be Anderson “E series” with simulated divided lites not vs the Millgard option shown and the comment about true divided. The applicant confirmed that to be true.

Decision:

Commissioner Friedman: Made a motion to APPROVE the project with Conditions:

- Confirm Assessor reported square footage with staff.

The project meets Specific Findings #2, #3, and #5

Commissioner Cross: Seconded the motion.

APPROVED

(Ayes: 5; No: 0), 0 Absent.

NEW ITEMS

4. 2025 Alpha Street

Applicant: Robert “Rocky” Paulsen

Project No: 2216-COA

Year Built: 1922

Architectural Style: Colonial Revival

Historic Status Code: 5D1

Historic District: Valley View Historic District (Potential District)

Project Description:

The Cultural Heritage Commission considered a request for a 746 square foot single story rear addition to an existing 1,428 square foot colonial revival home. The addition will provide a new 516 square foot master suite with bathroom and a new 230 square foot covered patio with 100 square foot pergola. Roofing materials will match the existing asphalt shingles, lap siding will continue with an altered reveal and wood double hung windows will be used on the addition.

Rocky Paulsen, applicant, gave a summary of the project clarifying that the siding exposure will be the same new vs old.

Staff noted that the application had mistakenly proceeded through Building Plan Check without applying for CHC; therefore had been re-routed to include CHC review.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Comment and Discussion:

Commissioner Gallatin asked for clarification about how the rear columns would be sided and could the columns be made to match in regards to top to bottom ratio. And asked for a clarification on the material of outdoor kitchen's terracotta tiles.

The applicant stated the column remains to be studied and that either a decorative paneled cover or something matching the siding would be installed, the base of the right column will be raised to coordinate in scale to the left column. The tiles are a non-glazed Saltillo tile.

Commissioner Thompson asked if existing windows would be reused and suggested measuring an existing window to order

The applicant noted that the existing windows are vinyl and therefore would not be re-used; rather upgraded to Anderson Fibrex window.

Commissioner Cross discussed some of the history of the pre-existing Monterey Hills Hotel and one of the neighboring homes was moved from the High School.

Decision:

Commissioner Morrish: Made a motion to APPROVE the project:

The project meets Specific Findings #2, #5, and #6

Commissioner Friedman: Seconded the motion.

APPROVED

(Ayes: 5; No: 0), 0 Absent.

5. **1100 Fair Oaks Avenue Unit #2**

Applicant: Roy Earلمان (RK Visual Innovations) Jesse Avinetta

Project No: 2214-COA

Year Built: 1937

Architectural Style: Vernacular

Historic District: 1100 Block Fair Oaks District (Potential District)

Historic Status Code: 5S3

Project Description:

The Cultural Heritage considered an application for two signs at 1100 Fair Oaks Ave unit #2, both signs will include color logo and copy for the BURGERim restaurant. The first wall sign (2'3"H x 13'L) located on the Oxley St façade above the storefront. The second panel sign (1'2"H x 2'9"L) located in a previously approved monument sign situated at the corner of Oxley St and Fair Oaks Avenue.

Commissioner Thompson recused for proximity to the project.

Public Comment:

None

Commission Comment and Discussion:

Commissioner Friedman noted that the monument sign had previously been approved and this will be a continuation of that approval.

Decision:

Commissioner Gallatin: Made a motion to APPROVE the project:

The project meets Specific Findings #2, #7, and #8

Commissioner Friedman: Seconded the motion.

APPROVED

(Ayes: 4; No: 0), 1 recused.

Discussion Items

6. 637 Meridian Avenue (CONCEPTUAL REVIEW)

Applicant: Martin Perry

Year Built: 1924

Architectural Style: Craftsman

Historic Status Code: 2D

Historic District: North of Mission District

Project Description:

The Cultural Heritage Commission considered a proposed addition and complete remodel to an existing one story 896 square foot Craftsman style home on a 4,290 square foot lot in a state of neglect and disrepair. The proposed 154 square foot addition to the first floor will expand the kitchen and add a master bathroom. The proposed 293 square foot addition to finish out existing/expanded attic space will enable the addition of two bedrooms and one bathroom. Existing garage to be repaired, but will remain in current location. New wood windows to replace the aluminum windows that were added over the years. Horizontal siding to repaired and replaced as needed.

Architect Anders Troedsson gave a summary of the project, asking for clarification of requirements for contributor vs listed site, specifically for adding a porch to the home, noting the home is listed as craftsman despite not exemplifying many of the characteristics listed in the Design Guidelines. Also noting that the Secretary of Interior Standards are intended to manage change, not prevent it. The applicant stressed they wanted guidance on the ability to add a porch.

Commission Comment and Discussion:

Commissioner Gallatin noted that the applicant had been in to chair review for discussion of the project. Commissioner Thompson noted that although the house is listed as a craftsman home, more specifically it is a “Pyramidal” home, typically found in Texas and the south as worker housing. Porches, when added, retain the roof pitch and break pitch at the porch. And asked if the 2nd story could be added without removing the roof.

The applicant responded that structurally it would not be feasible to install a cost effective super structure. Commissioner Gallatin noted the chimney was requested by CHC last meeting to remain according to the design guidelines. Also, “replacing” an historic feature should not be interpreted to mean “introduce” features that were not previously present.

The applicant summarized changes from the presentation last month to include the wrapped porch, retained chimney and removed proposed front dormer. Clarifying the rear dormer is offset and larger to accommodate the stairs; the side dormers are merely for light and ventilation.

Commissioner Friedman noted the Magnolia façade would be completely changed from the original.

7. **1709 Rollin Street (CONCEPTUAL REVIEW)**

Applicant: Alon Friedman (Architect)

Year Built: 1906

Architectural Style: Craftsman

Historic Status Code: 5D1

Historic District: Marengo School Craftsman District (Potential)

Project Description:

The Cultural Heritage Commission considered a proposal for a renovation and new two story rear addition to an existing two story 1,713 square foot craftsman home. In addition, a new two car garage is proposed to replace the existing undersized and failing single car garage. Materials and design to compliment the original include wood double hung windows, redwood lap siding and cedar shingle roof.

Staff noted the second floor unit is an existing condition and would be resolved at permitting.

The applicant summarized the project, noting the second story addition was permitted and had been used as a rental for several decades.

Commission Comment and Discussion:

Commissioner Gallatin noted that the applicant had come in for chair review.

Commissioner Thompson suggested the renderings were not helpful in this case, also that the addition is not in proportion to the existing home, leaving the former addition does not improve the alteration.

Suggesting the existing massing be altered to balance with the new.

Commissioner Friedman added that the new addition continues the inappropriate additions. Studying alterations of the former addition would improve the balance.

Commissioner Gallatin added that doubling the size of the home as proposed would require sensitivity to achieve subordination. The south and west elevations' columns, trellises are not correctly proportioned.

Also the letter in support of the garage demolition lacks photo documentation, evidence of structural integrity nor alternatives for reconstruction.

Additionally the tree on the property was discussed and referred the applicant to seek an arborist and meeting with the Public Works.

Commissioner Thompson clarified that the commission did not suggest demolishing the existing second story, rather reworking and mitigate the awkwardness and possibly the massing.

8. **915 Palm Avenue (Mills Act)**

Applicant: Robert "Dino" Pierone and Stefani Williams (Homeowner)

Year Built: 1907

Architectural Style: Craftsman

Historic Status Code: 5D1

Historic District: El Centro/Indiana/Palm District

Project Description:

The Commission considered an application for a Mills Act contract for a contributing property of a local historic district. A letter of intent for this Mills Act application was filed May 19, 2016. A subcommittee was formed; however new commissioners need to be identified for a current subcommittee. The Mills Act application will be received for file and review.

The homeowners summarized some previous work and noted the need to work on the exterior; therefore the benefits of the Mills Act application to continue the work.

Commission Comment and Discussion:

Commissioner Gallatin clarified with staff that the evening's action would be to appoint a new subcommittee to take over from the original subcommittee formed in 2016. Also noting that the foundation work, although mentioned was not included in the application. Noting that some attachments to the report were for a different project.

Consultant Debi Howell-Ardilla, for the applicant, noted that the foundation work was not included in the financial analysis in keeping cost-benefit parity.

Commissioner Gallatin and Cross volunteered to form a subcommittee to study the application.

9. 209 Beacon Ave (Mills Act)

Applicant: Mark and Gail Wilson (Homeowner)

Year Built: 1900-1962

Architectural Style: California Modern

Historic Status Code: 4S2

Historic District: Buena Vista / Prospect Addition District

Project Description:

The Commission considered an application for a Mills Act contract for Landmark No. 52 (the Whitney R. Smith House and Studio). A letter of intent for this Mills Act application was filed February 21, 2019. A subcommittee was formed for review of the proposal. The Mills Act application will be received for file and review.

The homeowners gave a summary of the Landmark application process and the additional need for physical repairs on the home.

Commission Comment and Discussion:

Commissioner Gallatin asked for clarification from staff if the application process could be accelerated or if recommendations of Mills Act Applications be made between July and September.

Staff later noted that recommendations must be made between July and September (before September 30th)

Commissioners Thompson and Friedman commented that they had previously visited the site and would prepare their report to the CHC.

10. 1024 Indiana Avenue (CONCEPTUAL REVIEW)

Applicant: Nathan Swell

Year Built: 1921

Architectural Style: Craftsman

Historic Status Code: 5D1

Historic District: El Centro/Indiana/Palm Addition District

Project Description:

The Cultural Heritage Commission considered a proposal for a 1,090 square foot single story addition to an existing 784 square foot single story Craftsman style house on a 6,282 square foot lot. The proposed addition is located on the rear elevation of the house. A 279 square foot unpermitted addition will be

demolished. In addition, a new 400 square foot two vehicle carport is proposed. The proposed exterior materials for the addition will match the existing house materials.

Commission Comment and Discussion:

There was no discussion on this item, the applicant did not attend.

11. CHC Regular Meeting start time.

The Commission discussed adjusting the time of regularly scheduled meetings.

Commission Comment and Discussion:

The commission discussed the current 6:45 start time and if there is a practical need to continue the later start.

Decision:

Commissioner Friedman: Made a motion to change the start time of the Cultural Heritage Commission to the 3rd Thursday of the month (existing) at 6:30pm (new start time)

Commissioner Gallatin: Seconded the motion.

APPROVED

(Ayes: 5; No: 0), 0 Absent.

12. CHC subcommittee updates.

The Commission subcommittees discussed progress on outstanding projects.

Commission Comment and Discussion:

Commissioner Gallatin reported the Mills Act application for 320 Grand Avenue is progressing. A financial analysis has yet to be completed.

Commissioner Gallatin noted that no new information has been reported for the Rialto Theatre. Staff noted that there had been some leadership changes at the Rialto tenant (Mosaic) and that when staff last met with the applicant team they were seeking an historic Architect to assist with the planned improvements. Conditions of Approval for the theatre imposed a timeline that needs to be addressed.

Commissioner Friedman and Thompson noted the subcommittee visited 209 Beacon Avenue and that the work is within scope and requested of staff a template for a referral memo.

Commissioners Thompson and Friedman discussed seeking additional information regarding the Rollins Street cluster.

Discussion was postponed on the 1940's Apartment District until after the updated Historic Inventory is adopted by City Council.

COMMUNICATIONS

13. COMMENTS FROM COUNCIL LIASON:

No comments.

14. COMMENTS FROM COMMISSION:

Commissioner Thompson mentioned the need for information circulation of Secretary of Interior Standards to commission attendees.

Commissioner Cross asked staff about an existing parking analysis for 100 Fair Oaks Ave. Staff explained that the SPMC allows for nonstandard parking for historic buildings in the CG zones. Also describing the CUP restrictions required for the Multi-Tenant Retail Building as approved.

Commissioner Cross inquired about the possible ACE Hardware moving into the former OSH retail location.

15. COMMENTS FROM SOUTH PASADENA PRESERVATION FOUNDATION (SPPF):

No comments.

16. COMMENTS FROM STAFF:

Staff asked for input on Conceptual Reviews from the Commission, if previews are helpful before formal application.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

17. Minutes of the Regular Meeting for April 18, 2019.

Decision:

Commissioner Gallatin: Made a motion to APPROVE

Commissioner Morrish: Seconded the motion.

APPROVED

(Ayes: 5; No: 0), 0 Absent.

ADJOURNMENT

18. The meeting adjourned at 9:15 pm to the next regularly scheduled meeting on June 20, 2019.

APPROVED,



Mark Gallatin
Chair, Cultural Heritage Commission

10.31.19

Date